

INDEPENDENT PRICING AND REGULATORY TRIBUNAL

REVIEW OF TAXI FARES AND NEW ANNUAL TAXI LICENCES  
FROM 1 JULY 2018

Tribunal Members

Dr Peter Boxall, Chair, and Ms Deborah Cope, Member

Members of the Secretariat

Ms Jennifer Vincent, Ms Fiona Towers, Mr Justin Robinson  
and Ms Rhonda Nelson

At

Dubbo RSL Club Events Centre,  
Corner of Brisbane and Wingewarra Street, Dubbo

On Tuesday, 6 February 2018 at 11.00am

1 Opening remarks:  
2  
3 THE CHAIR: Good morning everybody and welcome. My name is 11:01:20  
4 Peter Boxall and I am Chair of the Independent Pricing and 11:01:27  
5 Regulatory Tribunal. I am joined today by my fellow 11:01:31  
6 tribunal member, Deborah Cope, and we are assisted by staff 11:01:34  
7 from the IPART Secretariat. 11:01:38  
8  
9 I would like to begin by acknowledging that we are 11:01:40  
10 meeting on the traditional land of the Wiradjuri people and 11:01:42  
11 I would like to pay my respects to the traditional 11:01:46  
12 custodians of that land and the elders both past and 11:01:50  
13 present. 11:01:54  
14  
15 At today's forum we would like to hear your views on 11:01:54  
16 IPART's draft report on the number of new annual taxi 11:01:58  
17 licences to be released outside Sydney, as well as maximum 11:02:01  
18 rank and hail fares statewide, both of which we 11:02:03  
19 recommend to Transport for NSW. 11:02:07  
20  
21 As well as the discussion today, we are seeking 11:02:10  
22 written submissions on the proposals in our draft report. 11:02:12  
23 The closing date for written submissions is 9 February. 11:02:14  
24 Our final report is due to be submitted to the Minister for 11:02:18  
25 Transport and Infrastructure by 9 March 2018. The Minister 11:02:21  
26 will determine when our final report is released publicly 11:02:28  
27 and Transport for NSW will make decisions about whether or 11:02:31  
28 not to follow our recommendations for fares and licences. 11:02:33  
29  
30 I will start today's proceedings with a brief overview 11:02:38  
31 of our approach to the review, our draft findings on 11:02:41  
32 competition and some of what we heard from participants in 11:02:44  
33 the public forums we held in Sydney and Coffs Harbour last 11:02:47  
34 week. 11:02:50  
35  
36 Our approach to this review started by looking at 11:02:52  
37 competition in the point to point transport market. 11:02:54  
38 Technology and regulatory changes have made the point to 11:02:57  
39 point transport market more competitive now and more open 11:03:00  
40 to competition in the future. Ultimately, in a competitive 11:03:04  
41 market there is less need to regulate fares because the 11:03:08  
42 forces of competition will ensure that participants charge 11:03:11  
43 the appropriate price for their services. 11:03:14  
44  
45 One aspect of competition we looked at was the size of 11:03:18  
46 the market for point to point transport and how big the 11:03:21  
47 taxi industry's share of that market is. We looked at bank 11:03:24

1 electronic transaction data to identify any changes in 11:03:28  
2 demand for taxis and rideshare between July 2015 and 11:03:31  
3 September 2017. We found that in areas where rideshare has 11:03:36  
4 commenced there has been rapid take-up of rideshare 11:03:42  
5 services, but this has in general not reduced the number of 11:03:45  
6 taxi trips being taken. 11:03:48  
7  
8 We also considered how easy it is to get into the taxi 11:03:50  
9 business. We found that in many parts of New South Wales 11:03:54  
10 the cost of taxi licences can make it harder for new 11:03:57  
11 participants and can prevent existing taxi companies from 11:04:01  
12 expanding services where they may want to put on extra 11:04:21  
13 vehicles. 11:04:25  
14  
15 Our draft finding was that competition was not yet 11:04:26  
16 sufficiently developed to remove maximum fare regulation 11:04:29  
17 for rank and hail services. We also found that a small 11:04:33  
18 increase in the number of new taxi licences would make it 11:04:36  
19 easier to get into the market, allow the taxi industry to 11:04:40  
20 compete more effectively with hire vehicles and improve 11:04:43  
21 services to passengers. 11:04:47  
22  
23 At the public forums in Sydney and Coffs Harbour we 11:04:49  
24 heard from the industry that competition had developed very 11:04:52  
25 rapidly and there had been a decrease in demand for taxi 11:04:55  
26 services. Participants said that the number of trips per 11:05:00  
27 hour had dropped off, that drivers were having to work 11:05:03  
28 longer hours to get the same takings as previously and that 11:05:06  
29 many drivers were preferring to work for hire vehicle and 11:05:09  
30 rideshare companies. Participants from country areas also 11:05:13  
31 reported increased competition from courtesy transport and 11:05:16  
32 community transport. 11:05:20  
33  
34 Industry participants also thought there was little 11:05:22  
35 distinction between rank and hail work and booked work, so 11:05:24  
36 hire vehicles are effectively competing for all the same 11:05:28  
37 work as taxis, particularly in country areas where there is 11:05:31  
38 not a lot of rank and hail work. We would be interested to 11:05:36  
39 see whether this gels with your experiences and in 11:05:39  
40 particular to get any data on the percentage of rank and 11:05:42  
41 hail trips in areas outside Sydney. 11:05:45  
42  
43 I will open up discussion for you now and we would 11:05:49  
44 like to test both our draft findings on competition and the 11:05:52  
45 views expressed by participants in other public forums 11:05:55  
46 against your own experiences. Later we will have a short 11:05:59  
47 presentation on our draft recommendations on fares and 11:06:03

1 licences and invite discussion on those topics. 11:06:06  
2  
3 As the hearing is being recorded and transcribed, 11:06:11  
4 I ask that speakers please identify themselves and, where 11:06:14  
5 relevant, their organisation and to try and speak clearly 11:06:17  
6 and loudly. 11:06:21  
7  
8 Before opening it up to the floor, I invite Kelly, 11:06:23  
9 from Transport for NSW, to make a short statement. 11:06:26  
10  
11 MS MILLER: I am Kelly Miller. I am the director of point 11:06:32  
12 to point implementation at Transport for NSW. David Tooze 11:06:34  
13 is here as well. He is the director of operations at the 11:06:37  
14 Point to Point Transport Commission. 11:06:40  
15  
16 As Peter mentioned, under the legislation, 11:06:43  
17 Transport for NSW determines each year the number of taxi 11:06:45  
18 licences to be issued in New South Wales and also the 11:06:49  
19 maximum fares for rank and hail taxi services. To assist 11:06:51  
20 Transport for NSW in this task, the Minister for Transport 11:06:55  
21 and Infrastructure asked IPART to conduct this review and 11:07:00  
22 to make recommendations for consideration. 11:07:02  
23  
24 I would like to thank IPART for their efforts in 11:07:05  
25 preparing the draft report and I would really encourage 11:07:08  
26 everyone to make submissions to IPART and to have your 11:07:11  
27 views heard and also I am looking forward to hearing 11:07:15  
28 everybody's views this morning. 11:07:20  
29  
30 THE CHAIR: I will ask David, from the Point to Point 11:07:21  
31 Transport Commission, to speak. 11:07:36  
32  
33 MR TAYLOR: Thank you. Hello, everybody. Just a quick 11:07:25  
34 wrap-up really. We are just gearing up at the Point to 11:07:27  
35 Point Transport Commission. I haven't really got much to 11:07:36  
36 say to open up, but I am open to questions afterwards, so 11:07:38  
37 if you've got any questions, if you'd like to talk about 11:07:40  
38 point to point, please feel free to talk about that after 11:07:43  
39 the meeting. Thanks. 11:07:45  
40  
41 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, David. And now 11:07:46  
42 Martin Rogers from the NSW Taxi Council. 11:07:48  
43  
44 MR ROGERS: Thank you, Peter. This is Martin Rogers from 11:07:52  
45 the NSW Taxi Council. For those who don't know me, I am 11:07:54  
46 the new CEO of the NSW Taxi Council and I am glad to be 11:07:57  
47 here with each and every one of you today and thank you all 11:08:00

1 for taking the time out of your busy day to come to this 11:08:04  
2 hearing. 11:08:08  
3  
4 The IPART draft report, from a Taxi Council 11:08:09  
5 perspective, we believe should not be adopted. We believe 11:08:11  
6 that the report and some of the findings in the report need 11:08:16  
7 to be questioned. We believe that it is open to big 11:08:19  
8 business and foreign ownership to come in and take services 11:08:23  
9 away from regional New South Wales, 137 new licences when 11:08:27  
10 you've still got 80-odd licences on hold. What are we 11:08:31  
11 doing to get them off hold first? It is not, as the report 11:08:35  
12 says, because you're doing market manipulation trying to 11:08:39  
13 keep prices high, it's just there's not enough demand. 11:08:43  
14  
15 Today is about you sharing your thoughts on how this 11:08:46  
16 report will affect your business. The members of IPART 11:08:49  
17 need to hear how it will impact you, and the 9th, which is 11:08:54  
18 this Friday, a written submission, we urge each and every 11:08:59  
19 one of you to write your written submission back for this 11:09:03  
20 report. If this report gets adopted, 137 new licences 11:09:06  
21 that can operate anywhere across New South Wales, 11:09:11  
22 cherry-pick events, take the good times and leave you guys 11:09:14  
23 for the times when people still need services. 11:09:17  
24  
25 The question is will there still be services available 11:09:21  
26 if this gets adopted. Today is your time so don't be 11:09:24  
27 afraid to get up and share your experiences of how this 11:09:29  
28 report will impact your business. Thanks. 11:09:32  
29  
30 THE CHAIR: Thanks very much, Martin. Questions, comments 11:09:39  
31 from the floor? Who would like to go first? 11:09:43  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36 MR J SPENCE: Good morning, everyone. My name is Jonathan 11:09:58  
37 Spence and I'm with Bathurst Taxis. I'm an owner and 11:09:58  
38 operator there, have been for seven or eight years. 11:10:02  
39 I noticed in your request for more data from taxis you have 11:10:05  
40 various questions, including the average booked fare and 11:10:10  
41 number of trips and vehicle expenses and so on, but you 11:10:13  
42 don't include any question about the cost of drivers. 11:10:16  
43 There is no recognition in here that drivers are a cost. 11:10:20  
44 50 per cent of my income goes to my driver. That appears 11:10:25  
45 not to be recognised in here and I'm wondering why it has 11:10:29  
46 been omitted. 11:10:32  
47

1 MS VINCENT: In our report and our approach to the review 11:10:40  
2 this time, rather than looking at a detailed breakdown of 11:10:45  
3 costs, as Peter set out, we actually looked at the state of 11:10:52  
4 competition as an indicator of whether or not going forward 11:10:57  
5 fares need to be set as prescriptively, perhaps, as they 11:11:05  
6 have been in the past. When you have a look at 11:11:10  
7 indicators, like lease fees and things like that, you can 11:11:13  
8 see from those that revenues exceed efficient costs without 11:11:17  
9 having to do a bottom-up build-up of costs. 11:11:23  
10  
11 We have done that in the past and we've used data 11:11:28  
12 which included driver incomes, but for this review we were 11:11:31  
13 looking at data like revenues as an indicator rather than 11:11:38  
14 as an attempt at breaking down the cost, so yes, that's why 11:11:44  
15 we didn't ask about driver costs. 11:11:49  
16  
17 MR SPENCE: I have a supplementary question or comment. 11:11:53  
18 In reality, my income is actually half what it appears to 11:11:59  
19 be. Is that recognised? You're looking at the income, 11:12:03  
20 that's fine, but I only get half of what it appears. The 11:12:06  
21 average fare is, say, \$10 or \$15, whatever it is, but the 11:12:09  
22 operator only gets half of that. If it is being reported 11:12:13  
23 that the fare is \$10 or \$15, it looks like my income is up 11:12:15  
24 here when actually this is my real income. 11:12:19  
25  
26 THE CHAIR: We recognise that, Jonathan. 11:12:21  
27  
28 MR SPENCE: Okay. 11:12:26  
29  
30 THE CHAIR: Yes. 11:12:27  
31  
32 MR M PHILLIPS: Michael Phillips, Orange Taxis. My 11:12:30  
33 question is in relation to the 137 proposed licences that 11:12:35  
34 you're going to release. Are there any restrictions on 11:12:39  
35 these in the sense of how many cars per operator that you 11:12:43  
36 will allow? 11:12:48  
37  
38 The basis of that question is that if you don't allow 11:12:51  
39 some sort of restriction then it is open slather for 11:12:53  
40 someone to take a number of those licences, move into an 11:12:58  
41 area and basically annihilate the local businesses. I find 11:13:01  
42 that that doesn't seem to be well enough explained. 11:13:07  
43  
44 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Michael. It is a draft recommendation 11:13:12  
45 - and that's why we're having these discussions - to 11:13:17  
46 increase the number of licences by 10 per cent and the 11:13:20  
47 draft proposal of those licences in the so-called 11:13:25

1 designated area, which are the larger areas in regional New 11:13:29  
2 South Wales, that the licences would be able to operate 11:13:33  
3 anywhere across the state, and also the draft 11:13:37  
4 recommendation is not to restrict them to a certain number 11:13:43  
5 per operator or to owner drivers, or things like that. 11:13:47  
6  
7 MR PHILLIPS: Can you see my point? 11:13:51  
8  
9 THE CHAIR: We can and we're listening to your point and 11:13:52  
10 that's right, we've heard that point of view which we've 11:13:55  
11 taken on board. You asked what the draft recommendation 11:14:00  
12 was and I'm explaining that. 11:14:02  
13 11:14:10  
14 11:14:17  
15 11:14:21  
16  
17 MS COPE: The two issues that we have been told about in 11:14:22  
18 the last couple of hearings around that were the concern 11:14:25  
19 about a new business coming into a town in competition with 11:14:28  
20 the existing business and the concern about licences being 11:14:33  
21 bought up by some of the major corporates and coming right 11:14:37  
22 across the regional areas in the state. Are both of those 11:14:41  
23 issues from your point of view or are there other issues 11:14:46  
24 around more licences? So from your perspective what are 11:14:50  
25 the biggest issues? 11:14:55  
26  
27 MR PHILLIPS: The major issue here is that when you supply 11:15:01  
28 your figures, which we have, as far as our income goes, we 11:15:06  
29 are operating on less than the basic wage for an income for 11:15:10  
30 ourselves personally. That is unsustainable into the 11:15:15  
31 future with competition that could come into an area. 11:15:20  
32 11:15:25  
33 I think the thing here has got to be understood. 11:15:25  
34 There may be on a Saturday night not enough cabs to handle 11:15:28  
35 the issue. On a Sunday, Monday, Tuesday, Wednesday night, 11:15:33  
36 and in places on a Thursday night, there are far too many 11:15:38  
37 cabs to handle the demand and the result - I can speak for 11:15:44  
38 Orange because I work of a night-time. We worked last 11:15:50  
39 night, we had 11 cabs out, that's out of a fleet of 20-odd 11:15:54  
40 cabs. That was twice too many. We didn't even earn \$10 an 11:15:59  
41 hour last night. 11:16:08  
42  
43 You can't sustain an industry on the basis of one-off 11:16:09  
44 nights: they're our survival nights. The issue of every 11:16:14  
45 other night is supplying a service to our customers. If we 11:16:18  
46 get competition into those nights where there is no money 11:16:22  
47 around at all, we're going to go belly up. 11:16:27

1  
2 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael. 11:16:32  
3  
4 MR M MAHONEY: Thank you. My name is Michael Mahoney and 11:16:40  
5 I'm from Orange. I want to say just a couple of things. 11:16:43  
6 Everyone seems to think that the pie is so big. The pie is 11:16:48  
7 only so big and regional centres like Orange can only 11:16:54  
8 sustain a certain amount of competition. In places like 11:16:58  
9 Sydney you've got the geographical areas, you've got the 11:17:01  
10 population to do it. In regional and country areas we 11:17:04  
11 don't have it. What you're doing is a recipe for chaos. 11:17:07  
12 It is a recipe for sending this industry into insolvency. 11:17:12  
13 Thank you. 11:17:18  
14  
15 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Michael. 11:17:20  
16  
17 MR M BAGGIO: Good morning. I am Marino Baggio from 11:17:28  
18 Wagga Taxis. I have been to a number of these seminars and 11:17:34  
19 I'm always cynical that nothing ever changes from what we 11:17:39  
20 say or recommend to your final report, but be that as it 11:17:43  
21 may, what my concern is over the years I've worked seven 11:17:49  
22 days a week to earn a living and pay off an investment for 11:17:55  
23 my superannuation and that has all changed. 11:18:00  
24  
25 I am not quite sure what you're trying to do with 11:18:05  
26 these extra cabs or plates being released. I just did an 11:18:08  
27 exercise with my own vehicle on my average vehicle taking 11:18:13  
28 and from that I averaged it over a 52-week period and off 11:18:25  
29 that I picked a certain number of weeks, which average it 11:18:29  
30 out, and on that my average income of the car is \$33.66 per 11:18:33  
31 hour. With that I've got to pay the drivers and I've got 11:18:40  
32 to pay the maintenance of the car. How far down do you 11:18:43  
33 want us to go on our takings? Are we going to earn less 11:18:47  
34 than the lowest income? We are probably earning less than 11:18:52  
35 what you're getting. 11:18:57  
36  
37 Have you ever taken that into consideration? In Wagga 11:19:00  
38 we have two rideshare services up and running but our 11:19:04  
39 biggest competitor is the second car. It's no good saying, 11:19:08  
40 "Oh yes, more people will use cabs", but if they've got the 11:19:14  
41 second car that's their convenience. Secondhand vehicles 11:19:17  
42 are pretty cheap and they're easily obtainable and some 11:19:21  
43 families have three or four as the kids grow up, so what 11:19:25  
44 are we fighting? 11:19:29  
45  
46 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Marino. You can be sure, Marino, we 11:19:33  
47 do listen and we do change our position, so don't worry 11:19:43



1 about that. We are taking this very seriously. These are 11:19:47  
2 draft proposals and what happens is we listen to what 11:19:52  
3 happens at the public consultations, we take on board 11:19:56  
4 submissions, and then we make some changes before we 11:20:00  
5 present it to the Minister, but I just wanted to reassure 11:20:02  
6 you on that and thanks for attending. 11:20:05  
7

8 MR R STAPLETON: Thank you. Ray Stapleton from Bathurst. 11:20:13  
9 I would just like to make a comment on just how much damage 11:20:17  
10 these draft suggestions have made. I am 76. I promised my 11:20:22  
11 family I would retire at 75. Now, I know it's nothing to 11:20:27  
12 do with IPART, but because of the uncertainty created in 11:20:32  
13 the industry since December 2015, I simply cannot retire. 11:20:36  
14 I have been working on one of my drivers. I have been in 11:20:42  
15 the industry for 30 years. I've been in the workforce 11:20:46  
16 since 1956, so I reckon I've done my share. I am entitled 11:20:49  
17 to retire. 11:20:54  
18

19 I have been trying to talk my driver into buying the 11:20:56  
20 cab. He has been with me since 2001. When this draft came 11:20:59  
21 out and we started getting signatures to say how damaging 11:21:04  
22 it was going to be, I offered him my plates at half price 11:21:09  
23 to try and talk him into it. He immediately dropped out. 11:21:13  
24 He is no longer a prospect to buy my plates simply because 11:21:19  
25 of the damage that we can all see. He is an experienced 11:21:25  
26 bloke and I've been around a fair while. In 1988 I got 11:21:28  
27 into the business, so I've been around for a while, I've 11:21:33  
28 seen a lot of change. 11:21:36  
29

30 In Bathurst in that time, where I come from, the 11:21:38  
31 population has increased dramatically, but the work has 11:21:40  
32 dropped because of the buses now. It wasn't viable for 11:21:45  
33 buses 30 years ago when I started. Someone else mentioned 11:21:50  
34 about the one car. 30 years ago people had one car. Now 11:21:54  
35 cars are like televisions, they've got them in every 11:21:58  
36 flaming room almost, so now they don't have to wait for the 11:22:02  
37 car to come home, whereas once they had to use a taxi 11:22:06  
38 because they only had one car and the breadwinner was using 11:22:10  
39 it. All that has changed. Supermarkets are open all the 11:22:14  
40 time, almost, so people can go and shop whenever there's a 11:22:18  
41 car available. 11:22:21  
42

43 Things have also changed, like, my mum, for example, 11:22:22  
44 didn't drive a car. You can call me sexist, if you like, 11:22:26  
45 but in her era men told women they were too stupid to learn 11:22:29  
46 to drive, so they didn't, they believed them, apparently, 11:22:33  
47 so often women didn't drive, or a lot of people didn't have 11:22:35

1 licences. Now everyone gets a licence when they leave 11:22:39  
2 school. So much has changed. I hope you can hear my - it 11:22:42  
3 has shattered my future retirement. I promised my family 11:22:46  
4 I would retire at 75. I now can't retire. I try and put 11:22:50  
5 drivers in the damn thing. I can't get a driver to sit out 11:22:57  
6 there and earn eight bucks an hour at night. I can't 11:23:01  
7 afford to leave it off the blasted road, so I have to drive 11:23:04  
8 it.  
9  
10 Here I am at 76 driving, picking up drunks at 11:23:08  
11 three o'clock in the flaming morning because I can't get a 11:23:12  
12 driver. So that's the effect on old blokes like me that 11:23:15  
13 this draft report - and I know it's not even fact yet, but 11:23:18  
14 that's the sort of damage it is causing. It will kill this 11:23:23  
15 industry and old blokes like me might even pop themselves 11:23:26  
16 because they can't see any other flaming way out of it. 11:23:30  
17 I am sorry to get so emotional about it, but that's exactly 11:23:34  
18 how I feel. 11:23:38  
19  
20 THE CHAIR: Thanks very much, Ray. 11:23:45  
21  
22 MR K BYRNE: Ken Byrne from Mudgee Radio Cabs. You're 11:23:52  
23 going into this draft report and you're going to be putting 11:23:55  
24 more cabs into towns, et cetera, et cetera. My wife and I, 11:23:58  
25 we own the cabs in Mudgee and we find that most of the time 11:24:02  
26 eight out of ten cabs is enough, six is more than enough, 11:24:10  
27 with school runs, et cetera, and no-one gets left behind. 11:24:14  
28  
29 On the weekend, the same of a night-time. As other 11:24:18  
30 people have said, they put minimum cars on so the drivers 11:24:21  
31 can make the maximum they can get, which is not a lot of 11:24:23  
32 money, then of a Thursday night we put more on: Friday, 11:24:27  
33 Saturday night it's open slather. 11:24:32  
34  
35 Then you have, like in town, one of our buses somehow 11:24:34  
36 got attached to my authority and every time we get on to 11:24:39  
37 the government it's, "Oh, you've got to see your partner in 11:24:44  
38 crime." He is no partner of mine, he's opposition, but 11:24:46  
39 someone in their wisdom gave him all my information, 11:24:50  
40 actually, last year until I found out because I was left 11:24:54  
41 behind. 11:24:57  
42  
43 Then we've overcome that little problem, but the buses 11:25:00  
44 are running riot. We have other vehicles running riot. 11:25:03  
45 Rank and hail. The buses are doing rank and hail. They 11:25:11  
46 pull up just up from the rank. I get on to the government 11:25:15  
47 and say, "What about this?" They've become a mirror. They 11:25:18

1 say, "Oh, we'll look into it", and you never even get a 11:25:21  
2 result. 11:25:23  
3  
4 By putting more cabs on, say, the likes of Mudgee, 11:25:25  
5 where are the licensed operators? Who are they going to 11:25:30  
6 run on, that's one question, or do they just run riot and 11:25:32  
7 do what they want to do and I get the blame for it? 11:25:37  
8 11:25:39  
9 I can't see any future for any of us. If this is 11:25:39  
10 passed and goes through, we'll all go broke, belly up, 11:25:42  
11 no-one will be out there to take sick people home from 11:25:46  
12 hospital, et cetera, after midnight, and the drunks and all 11:25:49  
13 the others that are hanging around, no-one wants them. 11:25:52  
14 I have two cabs on 24/7. They go around and around and 11:25:56  
15 around the place. I compensate my drivers for staying out 11:26:00  
16 and in the end my income is very little, by the time I keep 11:26:05  
17 everything on the road and give them their 45 per cent of 11:26:10  
18 the takings and I pay everything else, except their GST and 11:26:14  
19 super, and you tell me where we're going to go if this 11:26:18  
20 comes in. Down the gurgler. 11:26:21  
21  
22 THE CHAIR: Okay, thanks, Ken. 11:26:24  
23  
24 MR G COLLIN: Thank you. Greg Collin, Dubbo Radio Cabs. 11:26:35  
25 Our biggest concern that we find is the community. We 11:26:41  
26 believe the community will suffer. At the moment we run 11:26:46  
27 24/7 here in Dubbo, like a lot of other regional country 11:26:51  
28 New South Wales taxis, the problem being, as it has been 11:26:57  
29 said before, our drivers are out there on the slow nights 11:27:02  
30 earning their \$7, \$8, \$9, \$10 an hour, but that's a 11:27:06  
31 condition that we have with our drivers that they work 11:27:12  
32 those down times so on the weekends they can afford to top 11:27:16  
33 up their wage. 11:27:21  
34  
35 With the release of new licences you don't have to be 11:27:23  
36 Einstein to know that the work is not there during the 11:27:30  
37 down times, so they will buy up these licences to 11:27:34  
38 cherry-pick on the Friday and Saturday nights. I have two 11:27:40  
39 drivers that work full-time in my taxi. They have 11:27:44  
40 indicated to me already that - one bloke is already 11:27:49  
41 struggling. He has already told me that if he finds a 11:27:53  
42 full-time job, he'll be leaving. The other bloke that 11:27:56  
43 works the Friday/Saturday nights has indicated to me that 11:28:00  
44 if the competition comes out on Friday or Saturday nights 11:28:03  
45 and his wage decreases any more, that he will no longer be 11:28:07  
46 able to work a taxi. 11:28:13  
47

1           The long and the short of it will be it will be back 11:28:16  
2 to me doing the hours. Now, I can only do so many hours, 11:28:20  
3 12 hours. Now, if I wanted to service the people going out 11:28:26  
4 to the airport early in the morning, at five o'clock, then, 11:28:29  
5 including a meal break at six o'clock that night, my taxi 11:28:33  
6 will be in the driveway; so I'll have to go out and 11:28:37  
7 cherry-pick. 11:28:42  
8  
9           The community heavily relies on us and not just the 11:28:43  
10 general community but community transport. They work nine 11:28:47  
11 to five and they've asked us can we help out with some of 11:28:51  
12 their customers because they've finished work. 11:28:54  
13  
14           It is going to be the community - the loss of jobs, 11:28:59  
15 number one, but the community will suffer at large because 11:29:02  
16 we will not be able to afford the 24/7 operation. Thank 11:29:05  
17 you for your time. 11:29:11  
18  
19 THE CHAIR: Thank you. 11:29:16  
20  
21 MS TOWERS: Can I just ask how much rank work you do, or 11:29:19  
22 rank and hail? 11:29:21  
23  
24 MR SPENCE: Can I answer that question for Bathurst, 11:29:24  
25 please? 11:29:26  
26  
27 THE CHAIR: You can in a second, Jonathan. Greg? 11:29:26  
28  
29 MR COLLIN: In Dubbo, it's roughly around 20 per cent. 11:29:30  
30  
31 THE CHAIR: Jonathan? 11:29:34  
32 11:29:35  
33 MR SPENCE: Bathurst Taxi is about a bit over 30 per cent 11:29:36  
34 rank and around about 70 per cent booking. 11:29:38  
35  
36 THE CHAIR: Thank you. 11:29:44  
37  
38 MS TOWERS: Thank you. 11:29:46  
39  
40 MS L PHILLIPS: Lyn Phillips from Orange Taxis. I just 11:29:48  
41 wanted to know how you arrived at the figure of 137 extra 11:29:53  
42 plates being warranted and is it because of the KPI rates, 11:29:58  
43 is that how it is worked out? Are there issues, huge 11:30:05  
44 issues in country areas with waiting times? 11:30:09  
45  
46 THE CHAIR: We will do a presentation on that, Lyn, but, 11:30:17  
47 in a nutshell, there is evidence in some areas where, to 11:30:20

1 buy the new plates, the cost is very high to get into some 11:30:30  
2 areas. There are situations, according to the survey, 11:30:34  
3 where there was an issue of a shortage of cabs in some 11:30:42  
4 areas at some times, so we looked at that and as will be 11:30:45  
5 explained later, there was an option to have a draft 11:30:51  
6 recommendation of a very small increase or to have a large 11:30:56  
7 increase. In the end, we opted for around 10 per cent, but 11:30:59  
8 we'll get a chance to discuss it more later. Go ahead. 11:31:04  
9

10 MS PHILLIPS: It doesn't seem to be logical that because 11:31:08  
11 some areas may be struggling with pick-up times or their 11:31:10  
12 cabs are worth a lot of money, that you just send these 11:31:16  
13 cabs out to demolish anyone and everyone. 11:31:20  
14

15 THE CHAIR: No, that's not the aim. 11:31:25  
16

17 MS PHILLIPS: It's going to happen. 11:31:28  
18

19 THE CHAIR: We are listening to you. 11:31:30  
20 11:31:32

21 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Come on, get fair dinkum! 11:31:33  
22

23 THE CHAIR: No, we are listening to you. The point is, 11:31:35  
24 Lyn, that, as we'll get to, in the draft recommendation to 11:31:37  
25 increase the number of cabs, they were to operate across 11:31:42  
26 the state and hence, gravitate to the areas where they were 11:31:46  
27 more required as opposed to going to areas where they're 11:31:49  
28 not. 11:31:52  
29

30 MS PHILLIPS: And so how did they get that information? 11:31:53  
31

32 THE CHAIR: Pardon? 11:31:56  
33

34 MS PHILLIPS: How did they get that information? 11:31:57  
35

36 THE CHAIR: The draft recommendation - and I repeat, it is 11:32:00  
37 a draft - is to increase by 10 per cent and in a designated 11:32:04  
38 zone, which is where many of you operate, the larger towns, 11:32:09  
39 that they would be able to operate anywhere across New 11:32:12  
40 South Wales. So if you have a particular town where 11:32:17  
41 there's not a shortage of cabs or there's an excess number 11:32:21  
42 of cabs, it's unlikely that a new cab would go to that 11:32:25  
43 town. It is more likely that a new, cab under the draft 11:32:29  
44 proposal, would go to a town where there is a greater 11:32:32  
45 demand for them. 11:32:37  
46

47 MS PHILLIPS: But I think it is a bit like Michael said. 11:32:40

1 There are nights we have that are the icing on the cake for 11:32:42  
2 us, other nights you do it for not the love of it, but 11:32:46  
3 because you've got a sense of duty to your customers. 11:32:52  
4

5 THE CHAIR: Sure. 11:32:55  
6

7 MS PHILLIPS: So then these floating cabs can just go and 11:32:57  
8 deposit themselves on those good nights and then, 11:33:02  
9 therefore, it will decrease our incomes on those nights 11:33:06  
10 that make our hourly rate not even acceptable, but, 11:33:10  
11 you know, somewhat survivable. 11:33:15  
12

13 THE CHAIR: We will get a chance to discuss it further. 11:33:20  
14 Thanks, Lyn. Other comments or questions at this stage? 11:33:22  
15 Michael?  
16

17 MR MAHONEY: The thing that I want to raise is the social 11:33:32  
18 benefit of cabs and we of a night-time, you know, from 11:33:36  
19 10 o'clock onwards, take a lot of people home that are 11:33:43  
20 intoxicated or on drugs, or whatever else. We feel it is 11:33:48  
21 our responsibility to carry that out. I don't think we get 11:33:55  
22 too many complaints about the fact that someone was drunk 11:34:00  
23 and never got picked up. 11:34:03  
24

25 These people are appreciative of the fact that we do 11:34:06  
26 do that, but the thing is that when you have 11:34:08  
27 fly-by-nighters, they do not have that social 11:34:14  
28 responsibility to their local community, to take people 11:34:18  
29 home. You're never quite sure whether you're going to get 11:34:21  
30 them home before they spew in the cab or they pick a fight 11:34:26  
31 with you, or whatever else. I think from the experience 11:34:29  
32 with Uber in Sydney that that is an issue there, that you 11:34:32  
33 tend to like to take the better class of client, and the 11:34:39  
34 thing that you destroy when you do something like this is 11:34:43  
35 our social connection with our community. 11:34:48  
36

37 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Michael. 11:34:55  
38

39 MR G DENNING: My name is Ged Denning from Orange Taxis. 11:35:07  
40 You talk about the barrier of entry for the high priced 11:35:10  
41 taxi plates in some areas. Why is that an issue? It is 11:35:13  
42 like saying that the Commonwealth Bank share price is 11:35:18  
43 overpriced at \$80 and it should be \$50 so everyone else can 11:35:21  
44 buy some. It doesn't make any sense. 11:35:25  
45

46 If a taxi plate has gone up in value because it has 11:35:26  
47 been a successful area and those people have invested in it 11:35:29

1 and that's their superannuation then why should a 11:35:32  
2 government report take their superannuation and tear it in 11:35:35  
3 half? That is the first question. 11:35:37  
4  
5 THE CHAIR: Would you like a response to that now, Ged? 11:35:44  
6  
7 MR DENNING: Please, that would be lovely. 11:35:47  
8  
9 THE CHAIR: The reason why it is looked at in this context 11:35:49  
10 is because if you have licensing, and in this case it's 11:35:53  
11 taxi cabs but it could be anything else, liquor licensing, 11:35:57  
12 anything else, but in this case it's taxi licences, if you 11:36:01  
13 have a licence which says that there are only 20 taxi 11:36:05  
14 cab licences for a particular area, say a large country 11:36:09  
15 town, and then what happens is that if the market drives up 11:36:12  
16 the price of those cabs and in some cases, as you guys well 11:36:18  
17 know, it gets up to 400,000, it might not be 400,000 now, 11:36:24  
18 I notice a few of you shaking your heads, but it has been, 11:36:29  
19 anyway, it gets up to several hundred thousand, if you 11:36:33  
20 have a situation like that, it's basically people who want 11:36:36  
21 to enter the industry have to pay several hundred thousand 11:36:39  
22 just to get the licence to operate the cab. 11:36:42  
23  
24 That is indicative that there is a shortage in that 11:36:46  
25 area and so that's why that's an issue which is looked at 11:36:49  
26 in this context and it's not just in country areas, it's 11:36:54  
27 looked at in the metropolitan area and in other 11:36:57  
28 jurisdictions, but that's the answer to it. It is 11:37:01  
29 different than the Commonwealth Bank because the 11:37:05  
30 Commonwealth Bank is actually a purchaser of equity and 11:37:07  
31 you're purchasing your share of an asset. In this case, 11:37:10  
32 you're purchasing the right to hold a licence and that's 11:37:15  
33 what's called economic rent and the higher the economic 11:37:19  
34 rent, the more indicative that there is a shortage, but 11:37:22  
35 that's the rationale, Ged. 11:37:25  
36  
37 MR DENNING: Thank you for your explanation, I understand 11:37:28  
38 what you're saying. However, the KPIs should indicate 11:37:30  
39 whether the service levels are sufficient in those areas 11:37:32  
40 and the takings of the tax in particular should determine 11:37:35  
41 whether the value that the person is expending to buy that 11:37:39  
42 licence makes it viable or not. 11:37:42  
43  
44 THE CHAIR: Yes, we do look at that as well, yes, thanks. 11:37:46  
45  
46 MR DENNING: The second part of my question, if I could 11:37:51  
47 finish on this--

1  
2 THE CHAIR: I am sorry, yes.  
3  
4 MR DENNING: It's nice to see that Transport for NSW is 11:37:53  
5 here because they should hear this. In the particular 11:37:56  
6 areas, especially in western New South Wales, the rise of 11:37:59  
7 community transport has been absolutely phenomenal. 11:38:02  
8 Community transport in Orange, for example, which is 11:38:05  
9 somewhere that I can speak with some authority about 11:38:08  
10 because I live there, is massive. They have more vehicles 11:38:10  
11 than we have taxis. We have 26 taxis on the fleet in 11:38:14  
12 Orange and community transport would have in excess of that 11:38:19  
13 in the combination of wheelchair accessible vehicles, cars 11:38:21  
14 and other buses that they operate. 11:38:25  
15  
16 Everyone in this room pays tax, I'm assuming, and a 11:38:29  
17 lot of people in this room pay tax and derive that income 11:38:33  
18 from taxi services and those taxes are being used by the 11:38:37  
19 government to put on competition. 11:38:41  
20  
21 THE CHAIR: We have noted the increase in competition from 11:38:46  
22 community transport and other alternatives. Deborah? 11:38:49  
23  
24 MS COPE: Just a question around that, and somebody might 11:38:57  
25 want to answer it after the other gentleman has had his 11:39:00  
26 chance to have a say, and that is we have heard in other 11:39:03  
27 areas that the level of competition from community 11:39:09  
28 transport and also courtesy vehicles has increased 11:39:11  
29 dramatically in recent years. Is that your experience? 11:39:15  
30 11:39:20  
31 MR SPENCE: Yes. 11:39:20  
32  
33 MS COPE: And also, taxis haven't had a chance to be able 11:39:21  
34 to get into that area and get access to the same subsidies 11:39:24  
35 that other organisations have. Is that also your 11:39:30  
36 experience? 11:39:33  
37 11:39:33  
38 MR SPENCE: Yes and yes. 11:39:34  
39  
40 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Deborah. 11:39:37  
41  
42 MR D CURRAN: My name is Darryl Curran, I am the chairman 11:39:42  
43 of Orange Taxis. I find it hard to believe that you've put 11:39:43  
44 a report together - and I missed the start of the meeting, 11:39:48  
45 so I'm not sure who is who up there - but you really didn't 11:39:52  
46 know what the rank and hail compared to point to point 11:39:56  
47 transport is. You are, effectively, doing something 11:39:59



1 without the information. Rank and hail in Orange is 11:40:02  
2 30 per cent. Okay? 11:40:06  
3  
4 I think the other thing that needs to be said is that 11:40:07  
5 if you really believe that somebody is going to choose 11:40:10  
6 where they put their taxi, one of these 134 taxis, that's 11:40:13  
7 crazy. If I'm going to put one on - and I live in Orange 11:40:19  
8 and I have a family in Orange - I'll just put it on in 11:40:22  
9 Orange. I'm not going to grab a taxi to Wagga or somewhere 11:40:25  
10 else. People aren't going to uproot their families because 11:40:26  
11 they can earn \$50 more in Wagga than they can in Orange. 11:40:31  
12 They'll just put it on in Orange and keep their lifestyle 11:40:35  
13 the same. 11:40:38  
14  
15 I don't think there has been enough input into the 11:40:39  
16 KPIs. Orange's average pick-up time is four minutes. 11:40:42  
17 I guarantee you that if you release plates, we will get 11:40:46  
18 plates in Orange. That would decrease, so that four-minute 11:40:48  
19 pick-up time, which I think is very reasonable, it will go 11:40:52  
20 down to three minutes. I don't understand what that's 11:40:54  
21 going to achieve. 11:40:57  
22  
23 THE CHAIR: Okay, thanks, Darryl. 11:40:58  
24  
25 MS TOWERS: Could I just say that we do have information 11:41:02  
26 about rank and hail. We collect information every year. 11:41:04  
27 We were just testing it with you here to see whether our 11:41:08  
28 information is consistent with what your experience is. 11:41:10  
29  
30 THE CHAIR: Yes. Jonathan? 11:41:14  
31  
32 MR SPENCE: I would like to go back and talk some more 11:41:18  
33 about the viability of this industry. I think the idea of 11:41:22  
34 introducing 10 per cent additional plates at any time is 11:41:28  
35 highly questionable, but I really wonder if you've taken on 11:41:32  
36 board the turmoil that this industry has been going through 11:41:36  
37 in the last couple of years, I'd say, with the legalisation 11:41:39  
38 of ride sharing, booked services, and the huge impost that 11:41:42  
39 has resulted from the New South Wales Government just 11:41:46  
40 handing over responsibility to the networks to manage their 11:41:48  
41 business. 11:41:51  
42  
43 It is a huge amount of additional work that networks 11:41:53  
44 have to pick up and irrespective of their size it is an 11:41:55  
45 enormous workload, the cost of which is borne by who can 11:42:00  
46 say. Who is going to pay for the additional costs that our 11:42:04  
47 network incurs in complying with those compliance costs? 11:42:07

1 Would you like to answer me that? 11:42:11  
2  
3 THE CHAIR: I assume that you will pay some of it. 11:42:13  
4  
5 MR SPENCE: Exactly. We will pay a lot, sir. It will 11:42:15  
6 have to come out of our margin. You are recommending yet 11:42:17  
7 another fare freeze. We have had a 2 or 3 per cent fare 11:42:21  
8 increase in the last five years. That has nowhere near 11:42:25  
9 kept up with inflation and the cost of providing services. 11:42:28  
10 Yet, we're being squeezed with all these additional costs 11:42:32  
11 and you want to put on additional plates. 11:42:35  
12  
13 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Jonathan. Anybody else? 11:42:38  
14  
15 MR D TAYLOR: David Taylor from Narromine. Probably 11:42:47  
16 because we're so small I don't think anybody would start up 11:42:50  
17 a new taxi business in Narromine. It is basically 11:42:53  
18 struggling now, you would have to be silly to get out 11:42:57  
19 there, but then most of us probably are to start with in 11:42:59  
20 the first place. 11:43:05  
21  
22 My comment is to do with the proposed freeze on fares. 11:43:05  
23 Because we had a change of situation a few years ago, 11:43:09  
24 actually, a lot of customers in town were being subsidised 11:43:15  
25 by the then operator. They had to then pay full fare. 11:43:18  
26 I don't think anybody stopped using the taxis because of 11:43:22  
27 that. Some went up \$3 or \$4 a trip just because of where 11:43:25  
28 they were and everything like that. 11:43:29  
29  
30 Most people just accepted it. Even now with the levy 11:43:31  
31 that has been put on, we haven't had any real negative 11:43:39  
32 comment on that. Okay, it's early days, but most people 11:43:43  
33 say, "Okay, it's \$10, now it's \$11, okay, we've got to wear 11:43:47  
34 it." If we were to put a freeze on taxi prices so people 11:43:52  
35 can't afford to pay an extra \$1 a trip, I don't think it's 11:43:56  
36 going to be a problem. If we actually have an extra dollar 11:44:02  
37 or two a trip, people are going to accept it, because if we 11:44:06  
38 don't, our fuel costs are still going up. 11:44:09  
39  
40 I am not an operator, I'm just a driver, but I do know 11:44:12  
41 there are day-to-day costs just living that are going up 11:44:17  
42 and, you know, why can't everybody else be part of that 11:44:20  
43 increase to help subsidise and to keep somebody on the 11:44:24  
44 road. I don't think people are going to have a problem 11:44:29  
45 paying an extra dollar or two for a fare if it's going to 11:44:31  
46 keep their business or their transport in place. 11:44:34  
47

1 THE CHAIR: Thank you very much, David. I was just 11:44:37  
2 wondering whether now is a good time to have a brief 11:44:39  
3 presentation and then we will continue the discussion. 11:44:42  
4

5 Just a point to keep in mind, David, that under the 11:44:44  
6 draft proposals Narromine is in the exempt area. We have 11:44:48  
7 this concept of designated and exempt, which you might or 11:44:53  
8 might not agree with but we'll go through that now, and 11:44:57  
9 Narromine is an example of a town in the exempt area and 11:45:00  
10 the draft proposal is not to regulate at a maximum 11:45:06  
11 regulatory fare in the exempt areas. I will call on Justin 11:45:11  
12 now from the secretariat to give a brief presentation. 11:45:16  
13

14 MR ROBINSON: Thank you, Peter. I will now briefly run 11:45:21  
15 through the draft recommendations we made in our draft 11:45:24  
16 report for taxi licences outside Sydney and maximum fares 11:45:26  
17 for rank and hail services across New South Wales, on which 11:45:30  
18 we are seeking feedback. 11:45:33  
19

20 After considering a range of changes to taxi numbers, 11:45:36  
21 we have recommended a 10 per cent increase in licences for 11:45:39  
22 outside Sydney. This will reduce the cost of acquiring a 11:45:42  
23 licence, help the taxi industry transition and compete in 11:45:46  
24 the growing point to point transport market by lowering 11:45:49  
25 costs and making more taxis available to meet demand. 11:45:52  
26

27 A 10 per cent increase in the number of licences would 11:45:56  
28 also be likely to improve taxi services for customers: 11:45:59  
29 for example, by reducing waiting times. We have 11:46:03  
30 recommended that new licences be released in several 11:46:06  
31 tranches throughout the year to provide price signals to 11:46:10  
32 buyers and sellers and to help develop the market for 11:46:12  
33 licences. 11:46:16  
34

35 We are also required to consider where these licences 11:46:18  
36 should be able to operate rank and hail services, noting 11:46:21  
37 that there are no longer operating area restrictions on 11:46:25  
38 booked services. However, for existing licence holders the 11:46:28  
39 current operating areas for rank and hail work would 11:46:32  
40 remain. 11:46:36  
41

42 We have proposed two zones to ensure that some new 11:46:36  
43 licences are available in regional and remote areas that 11:46:39  
44 would not be able to attract a new taxi licence under a 11:46:42  
45 competitive tender process. The zones we proposed are a 11:46:45  
46 designated zone, the blue area on the map on screen, which 11:46:49  
47 includes those operating areas with populations over 10,000 11:46:52

1 people, as well as operating areas with high licence 11:46:57  
2 values, more than five taxis, or in busy tourist areas. 11:46:59  
3  
4 The rest of New South Wales would form an exempt area, 11:47:03  
5 the grey area on the map on the screen, covering the rest 11:47:07  
6 of New South Wales, including areas that are currently 11:47:10  
7 exempt from fare regulation. New licences would be 11:47:13  
8 specified for either the designated zone or the exempt zone 11:47:16  
9 and we have recommended that there be separate allocation 11:47:20  
10 for each new zone. 11:47:23  
11  
12 As shown on screen, based on the number of licences of 11:47:29  
13 1 September last year, a 10 per cent increase in the taxi 11:47:32  
14 licences results in 124 new annual licences to be released 11:47:35  
15 by competitive tender in the designated zone and the 11:47:40  
16 initial allocation of 13 new annual licences for the exempt 11:47:42  
17 zone. 11:47:46  
18  
19 We have recommended that licences issued for the 11:47:47  
20 exempt zone are offered for an annual administrative fee 11:47:49  
21 that reflects the cost of issuing a licence similar to the 11:47:53  
22 fee for annual taxi licences recently introduced in 11:47:56  
23 Victoria. However, if this low licence fee leads to an 11:47:59  
24 oversubscription of these new licence, we have recommended 11:48:05  
25 that Transport for NSW makes a further determination for 11:48:07  
26 more licences in the exempt area. 11:48:11  
27  
28 We have recommended that the new licences for the 11:48:13  
29 designated zone be able to provide rank and hail services 11:48:15  
30 anywhere in New South Wales outside of Sydney, across both 11:48:18  
31 the designated and exempt zones. New licences for the 11:48:21  
32 exempt zone would be able to provide rank and hail services 11:48:25  
33 only within the exempt zone. They would not be able to 11:48:28  
34 provide rank and hail services in the designated zone. 11:48:31  
35 This is intended to prevent low fee licences moving into 11:48:34  
36 areas where licence values are much higher. It will also 11:48:37  
37 help attract and maintain taxi services in the exempt zone. 11:48:41  
38  
39 We have also recommended maintaining maximum fare 11:48:44  
40 regulation for rank and hail trips outside of Sydney in the 11:48:47  
41 designated zone and removing it in the exempt zone. Booked 11:48:51  
42 trips in taxis are no longer regulated in New South Wales. 11:48:54  
43  
44 We are not recommending any changes to the existing 11:48:59  
45 fares in the designated zone except for allowing a 11:49:02  
46 pass through of the passenger service levy imposed by 11:49:05  
47 government from 1 February. Places in the designated zone 11:49:08

1 currently covered by the urban fare schedule will continue 11:49:11  
2 to be regulated by the urban fare schedule and places in 11:49:14  
3 the designated zone covered by the country fare schedule 11:49:18  
4 will continue to be regulated by the country fare schedule. 11:49:20  
5  
6 We were also asked to look at maximum non-tariff 11:49:23  
7 charges for rank and hail trips, such as the maxi-taxi 11:49:26  
8 surcharge and the cleaning fee. We are not recommending 11:49:29  
9 any changes to these except, as noted earlier, to pass 11:49:32  
10 through the passenger service levy which we have 11:49:35  
11 recommended be identified as a separate charge in the fares 11:49:37  
12 order. This will mean no change to the fares order that 11:49:40  
13 has applied since last Thursday. I will now hand back the 11:49:43  
14 hearing to the Chair. Thank you. 11:49:47  
15  
16 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Justin. Further questions, comments, 11:49:51  
17 discussion, observations? 11:49:54  
18  
19 MR MAHONEY: Just with the disability services, we provide 11:50:04  
20 disability services in Orange. We run two maxi-taxis, 11:50:08  
21 they've cost \$80,000 each, we provided the working capital. 11:50:14  
22 We bought a couple of plates for \$430,000. What is your 11:50:18  
23 position in relation to disability services? 11:50:22  
24  
25 MS VINCENT: This review doesn't include WAT licences. 11:50:29  
26 They will continue to be available on the same terms that 11:50:32  
27 they're currently available, so we are only looking at -- 11:50:35  
28  
29 MR MAHONEY: If we do the economics - I am an accountant - 11:50:38  
30 the cost of putting a wheelchair vehicle on, plus the 11:50:40  
31 working capital, is the same price as buying a taxi licence 11:50:43  
32 in Orange now. I just wanted to make a point on that. 11:50:46  
33  
34 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Michael. 11:50:53  
35  
36 MR PHILLIPS: The presentation is a presentation based on 11:51:05  
37 supply and demand and price, basic economics, but what is 11:51:09  
38 missed in this one is that in the market, in the taxi 11:51:16  
39 market, it is such a dynamic market, that to say that by 11:51:22  
40 not increasing prices, you're going to get your various 11:51:32  
41 scenarios. I dispute that because I think that in reality 11:51:37  
42 people use taxis for various reasons. They use a taxi to 11:51:40  
43 provide transport. They use a taxi to make sure they don't 11:51:44  
44 get DUI. They use a taxi because they can't get into a bus 11:51:47  
45 or whatever else and the issue that you end up by just 11:51:52  
46 using something like a basic economic model is that I think 11:51:59  
47 it would be very helpful for you people to get out into a 11:52:04

1 taxi area, experience what goes on in the taxi area over a 11:52:11  
2 two or three days period and just see the reality of how 11:52:14  
3 basic economics is divorced from how the industry runs. 11:52:19  
4  
5 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Michael. What we have observed is 11:52:25  
6 that with the entrance of ride-sharing, particularly in 11:52:30  
7 Sydney but also in some places outside Sydney, that there 11:52:35  
8 has been an increase in the use of point to point 11:52:39  
9 transport. 11:52:45  
10  
11 What we have observed - and some people dispute this - 11:52:47  
12 is that there hasn't really been a decrease in the number 11:52:50  
13 of taxi rides, but any growth in the market has tended to 11:52:55  
14 go to rideshare and because rideshare in the Sydney area, 11:52:59  
15 for example, or Melbourne, can often be cheaper than taxi, 11:53:03  
16 it shows that people do respond to price. 11:53:07  
17  
18 What you're saying is - and you might be right - 11:53:09  
19 you're putting forward a proposition that basically people 11:53:12  
20 who use taxis in your town and other comparable towns use 11:53:16  
21 it, in a sense, irrespective of whether there's a price 11:53:20  
22 increase or not. That is not the evidence that we've seen 11:53:23  
23 but we're here to listen. What is apparent is that there's 11:53:27  
24 what's called this demand out there of people who would use 11:53:32  
25 taxis or rideshare if it's cheaper and what those people 11:53:36  
26 tend to be doing is using the ride-shares. 11:53:41  
27  
28 The issue which we would be very interested to get the 11:53:47  
29 reaction of you and your colleagues on is that in the event 11:53:50  
30 that you did increase the maximum fares and you all charged 11:53:56  
31 an increase in the maximum fares, whether you would start 11:53:59  
32 losing business to rideshare and other booked services who 11:54:02  
33 are not subject to the rank and hail fare. 11:54:05  
34  
35 MR MAHONEY: I think the thing here with rideshare is in 11:54:13  
36 the country areas you are not going to attract rideshare 11:54:15  
37 until there is a profit margin in it, that they can see the 11:54:19  
38 cost of their operation is getting a return. In country 11:54:22  
39 areas people, as I said before, use taxis for purpose. 11:54:27  
40 I have had some response to the dollar levy. That response 11:54:32  
41 has been, basically, "Well, if this is going to cost me too 11:54:36  
42 much I'm going to have to cut back on my taxi usage." The 11:54:40  
43 thing with increasing prices in the country or increasing 11:54:43  
44 our fares is that you don't whack on 10 per cent, as this 11:54:47  
45 levy has for pensioners because their fares are around 11:54:53  
46 about \$8 to \$10, and that means that they've gone up 10 to 11:54:56  
47 15 per cent, which is significant for them because they 11:55:00

1 rely on us to transport them. 11:55:02  
2  
3 The issue that you get with other people is that if 11:55:05  
4 they need the taxi, if they're going to go to the pub or 11:55:09  
5 they're going to get taken home from the pub, or whatever 11:55:12  
6 else, in all honesty, it's a lot cheaper than getting a 11:55:17  
7 \$600 DUI fine and they really say, and you get this in the 11:55:22  
8 cab, people will say, "Look, this is far better for me than 11:55:26  
9 to run the risk of being caught." 11:55:30  
10  
11 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael. 11:55:34  
12  
13 MS TOWERS: Would you prefer to have some flexibility so 11:55:37  
14 that you can charge the current price or a slightly lower 11:55:40  
15 price to your fixed income pensioners, with a slightly 11:55:43  
16 higher price when it's a Friday or a Saturday night? 11:55:47  
17  
18 MR MAHONEY: I think we need that flexibility, I most 11:55:51  
19 certainly do. 11:55:54  
20  
21 MS TOWERS: I would be interested in whether everybody 11:55:57  
22 else had that same view as well. 11:55:58  
23  
24 THE CHAIR: Darryl? 11:56:02  
25  
26 MR CURRAN: First of all, you made a point there before 11:56:05  
27 and we hear it all the time. If you really believe that 11:56:08  
28 people get rideshare in Sydney because it is cheaper, you 11:56:10  
29 guys have done no research. Okay? 11:56:15  
30  
31 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Yes, spot on.  
32  
33 MR CURRAN: They catch it because Sydney taxis provided a 11:56:17  
34 terrible service, that's why they use rideshare. I would 11:56:19  
35 like to know how many towns are in an undesignated area - 11:56:28  
36 I am sorry, in the non-exempt zone. 11:56:32  
37  
38 THE CHAIR: There's a list in the report. 11:56:35  
39  
40 MR CURRAN: I will have to have a look at that, but if 11:56:37  
41 you've got all this data and you know where the problem 11:56:40  
42 areas are, if you've really got the data, you'll know where 11:56:43  
43 the problem areas are. Why throw a blanket over the whole 11:56:47  
44 of New South Wales like this? 11:56:51  
45  
46 THE CHAIR: This was, essentially, Lyn's question earlier 11:56:53  
47 on. The issue here is that the draft recommendation is to 11:56:56

1 release more licences, which you don't agree with but 11:57:01  
2 that's the draft recommendation, and that those licences 11:57:04  
3 would be unrestricted and so they would gravitate towards 11:57:07  
4 the areas where they're wanted or required and they 11:57:11  
5 wouldn't go to areas where there's just not enough work. 11:57:16  
6  
7 In general, I wouldn't have thought people would buy a 11:57:22  
8 licence from the government competitive tender process and 11:57:27  
9 take it to a town where there's no work. 11:57:30  
10  
11 MR CURRAN: No. However, they will take it to a town -- 11:57:35  
12  
13 THE CHAIR: Where there is work. 11:57:37  
14  
15 MR CURRAN: No, that has appeal. 11:57:38  
16  
17 THE CHAIR: That has what? 11:57:40  
18  
19 MR CURRAN: That has appeal. 11:57:41  
20  
21 THE CHAIR: Appeal? 11:57:42  
22  
23 MR CURRAN: Appeal, somewhere where you want to live. 11:57:44  
24 They don't really care, they're not going to go and split 11:57:45  
25 hairs. The other thing that I just wanted to ask is we 11:57:47  
26 regularly have to request a value of a plate. Okay? We 11:57:51  
27 cannot be told how much a plate is worth in Orange. The 11:57:55  
28 only thing that they do is they base it on the last sale. 11:57:59  
29 When did you get the information on what a plate value is 11:58:02  
30 because Orange has already dropped 50 per cent down to 11:58:04  
31 \$115,000 in the last 12 months? 11:58:09  
32  
33 THE CHAIR: Yes, that's a good question - and I'll get to 11:58:11  
34 you, Lyn - and we've had a discussion of that at other 11:58:14  
35 forums. We collected the data over the last three years, I 11:58:20  
36 think, from RMS. At the Sydney forum, for example, people 11:58:24  
37 made the point that it has moved rapidly within the last 11:58:28  
38 few months. We are listening to that, but we have the most 11:58:32  
39 recent data. If there was a transaction last week, maybe 11:58:37  
40 we haven't got it yet, but that's another reason, and we're 11:58:42  
41 picking this up from the forums that it has actually gone 11:58:45  
42 down by more than the data is showing. 11:58:48  
43  
44 MR CURRAN: Yes, I can't stress that enough. I would 11:58:51  
45 throw the previous two years out and look at nothing less 11:58:53  
46 than 12 months old. 11:58:56  
47



1 MS TOWERS: And just to note now that the Point to Point 11:58:58  
2 Commission is actually publishing on their website 11:58:59  
3 transfers of licences and the value, so that's a fairly 11:59:02  
4 instantaneous publication. 11:59:05  
5  
6 MR TOOZE: Yes, by the third working day of the following 11:59:09  
7 month. 11:59:12  
8  
9 MS PHILLIPS: The introduction of more cabs, I'm just 11:59:17  
10 puzzled how you would see that as putting competitiveness 11:59:19  
11 into the market. They're taxis, I'm assuming they'll 11:59:25  
12 operate under the local network which sets the fares for 11:59:29  
13 bookings, and the rank and hail services, well, there's a 11:59:36  
14 maximum fare, so unless you get a rideshare company in like 11:59:40  
15 Uber or Oi, or someone else, how is this creating a 11:59:47  
16 competitive market, except just competition for the 11:59:52  
17 operators? It's not competitive for the customer price 11:59:56  
18 base. 12:00:02  
19  
20 THE CHAIR: Let's say you have a large town where the 12:00:04  
21 recent transfers of plates is very high and people want to 12:00:10  
22 get in there and the government puts out a tender and 12:00:13  
23 somebody bids and buys that to operate in that particular 12:00:18  
24 town. Because it is a taxi licence they can do rank and 12:00:23  
25 hail and booked. Anybody can do booked now, anybody can go 12:00:27  
26 into that town and do booked, and that in itself is 12:00:33  
27 competitive pressure for taxis, as we've discussed, along 12:00:35  
28 with rideshare. 12:00:38  
29  
30 MS PHILLIPS: But our prices are set. 12:00:41  
31  
32 THE CHAIR: No, the prices are not set. Your operator or 12:00:43  
33 your network might set the prices, but that's up to you 12:00:47  
34 guys. Prices are not set by Transport for NSW. They set 12:00:50  
35 the maximum. 12:00:58  
36  
37 MS PHILLIPS: But that operator is going to have to be 12:01:00  
38 operating under the network, aren't they? 12:01:02  
39  
40 THE CHAIR: No. 12:01:05  
41  
42 MS VINCENT: No.  
43  
44 MS PHILLIPS: They can come in and cut their prices. 12:01:07  
45  
46 THE CHAIR: They can come in, they can buy a taxi plate 12:01:08  
47 and what's more, existing plate holders can too and they 12:01:11

1 can operate independently. That is part of the reforms. 12:01:15  
2 This has nothing to do with IPART. These are the changes 12:01:18  
3 that the Government has made. That is how it would work, 12:01:22  
4 Lyn. Does that give you an idea? 12:01:28  
5  
6 MS PHILLIPS: Yes. 12:01:31  
7  
8 MR PHILLIPS: Just to add that, the complexities of 12:01:36  
9 running a taxi, first of all, you need a booking service to 12:01:38  
10 be able to provide the work to you. You can try and run, 12:01:46  
11 say, off an app. You have got to establish a market. In 12:01:50  
12 establishing that market you need some access to rank and 12:01:55  
13 hail because, simply, you're going to have to advertise, 12:01:59  
14 that costs you money, that sort of thing. The reality is 12:02:05  
15 that getting into an area with a new network or a new cab, 12:02:08  
16 or something or other else, isn't as easy as it seems. 12:02:13  
17  
18 MS PHILLIPS: No. 12:02:17  
19  
20 MR PHILLIPS: Your competition in that area isn't going to 12:02:22  
21 happen when there's no return. 12:02:24  
22  
23 THE CHAIR: You are right, it's not going to happen if 12:02:28  
24 there's no return because nobody will go to an area where 12:02:30  
25 there's no money in it. It is up to the people to make a 12:02:34  
26 judgment about whether they want to go into a particular 12:02:37  
27 area or not. 12:02:41  
28  
29 On the one hand we've heard a lot of testimony, a lot 12:02:42  
30 of comment about the competition from - I know you don't 12:02:46  
31 have rideshare in all your areas, but rideshare where 12:02:51  
32 rideshare is operating, community transport, courtesy 12:02:55  
33 vehicles, buses, et cetera, et cetera, so that competition 12:02:58  
34 is recognised. I think you could also argue that if 12:03:05  
35 somebody moved into your town, that would be competition as 12:03:08  
36 well. Lionel? 12:03:10  
37  
38 MR L HARRIS: Good morning. Lionel Harris, I have a 12:03:19  
39 connection with Yass Taxis. Is there a fee structure that 12:03:23  
40 you have in place for the new releases? 12:03:28  
41  
42 MS VINCENT: This is probably a good opportunity to 12:03:35  
43 explain how the new releases will work because I know this 12:03:37  
44 is the first time it has been done this way in areas 12:03:40  
45 outside Sydney. 12:03:43  
46  
47 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: It's already done. 12:03:50

1  
2 MS VINCENT: It is established in the legislation, the way 12:03:53  
3 it works. If there's anything other than a zero number, 12:03:54  
4 this is the way it will work. The process has been 12:03:57  
5 established. The number is what we've been asked to 12:04:00  
6 recommend. I am not describing a proposal, I'm describing 12:04:04  
7 something that's already there, if you want to go and have 12:04:10  
8 a look at the legislation, and this is the way it has been 12:04:12  
9 working in Sydney for several years now. 12:04:15  
10  
11 The licences are annual, they're automatically 12:04:20  
12 renewable up to nine times, so up to 10 years. They're 12:04:24  
13 released by tender, so Transport for NSW announces the 12:04:27  
14 number that will be released, the tender is called for and 12:04:33  
15 people are asked to make bids for the annual price that 12:04:37  
16 they would like to pay for that licence. 12:04:41  
17  
18 Say that there are 10 licences released, the 10 12:04:49  
19 highest tenders get those 10 licences at the price they 12:04:52  
20 bid. If you bid \$10,000 and that's the highest bid, or one 12:04:58  
21 of the top 10 bids, that's how much it will cost you. If 12:05:02  
22 you bid \$2,000 and that is one of the 10 highest prices, 12:05:06  
23 that is the amount you will pay, even if other people have 12:05:11  
24 bid different amounts. If you're one of the winning 12:05:14  
25 tenderers you pay the amount that you have bid for a year 12:05:18  
26 of having that licence and then, if you want, at the end of 12:05:21  
27 the year you can renew at that same price and that is the 12:05:23  
28 price you will always pay for each year that that licence 12:05:26  
29 is valid. You don't have to renew, so it is there for a 12:05:29  
30 year at a time. 12:05:36  
31  
32 With the licences not having a defined area of 12:05:40  
33 operations, that means, as Peter has said, people will make 12:05:44  
34 a decision about what a licence is worth to them to operate 12:05:48  
35 in a particular area. If there's an area where they think 12:05:52  
36 that they can make money from a licence at \$10,000, they'll 12:05:56  
37 bid \$10,000 and take that licence to that spot. If you're 12:06:00  
38 in an area which is already saturated where there are no 12:06:04  
39 opportunities to make money from the licence, people won't 12:06:07  
40 bid for it. 12:06:10  
41  
42 I am hearing people here being concerned that licences 12:06:10  
43 will be forced into their area, but the decision is not 12:06:13  
44 being made about where they're going to go by the 12:06:19  
45 government, by IPART, by Transport for NSW, the decision 12:06:22  
46 will be made by the people who make the bids and they will 12:06:25  
47 make the bids based on what value they think that licence 12:06:28

1 has and what opportunity there is in that area to work the 12:06:32  
2 licence. 12:06:38  
3  
4 THE CHAIR: Thank you. Jennifer is quite right, the 12:06:39  
5 process is in place. This is a discussion about the 12:06:42  
6 number, it could be zero or it could be more. Jonathan? 12:06:44  
7  
8 MR SPENCE: I've lost my question. Would you mind coming 12:06:54  
9 back? 12:06:56  
10  
11 THE CHAIR: Michael? 12:06:58  
12  
13 MR MAHONEY: Thank you, Peter. When you sit down and 12:07:02  
14 think about it and really separate the wheat from the 12:07:05  
15 chaff, at the end of the day, as far as this industry is 12:07:08  
16 concerned, we can't have unfair competition. We must have 12:07:10  
17 a level playing field. I reiterate what I said earlier, 12:07:13  
18 the pie is only so big and if you have an oversupply, it 12:07:17  
19 will end up in catastrophic mayhem. 12:07:21  
20  
21 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Michael. 12:07:27  
22  
23 MS S PERCEVAL: Sandy Perceval from Parkes Taxis. If 12:07:36  
24 those people have those licences and they find they're not 12:07:38  
25 making money in that area, can they just pick up that 12:07:41  
26 licence and go to another area? 12:07:44  
27  
28 THE CHAIR: Yes, they could under this proposal because, 12:07:46  
29 as Jennifer explained, Transport in the event they'd want 12:07:50  
30 to issue more licences, they would put them out to tender, 12:07:57  
31 people can bid, the winning bidder could take the licence 12:08:00  
32 anywhere in New South Wales if they're in the designated 12:08:04  
33 zone. 12:08:08  
34  
35 MS PERCEVAL: Say they find out that there's a big 12:08:10  
36 function going on somewhere, they'd just take their licence 12:08:12  
37 and their vehicle and just go and work in that area. 12:08:15  
38  
39 THE CHAIR: Yes. As happens now, if they're booked, you 12:08:18  
40 can have somebody who lives in Dubbo who runs a booked taxi 12:08:24  
41 and they can go elsewhere, but it has to be booked, it 12:08:29  
42 can't be rank and hail. Obviously, you need a taxi licence 12:08:32  
43 to do rank and hail. Jonathan? 12:08:36  
44 12:08:41  
45 MR SPENCE: Thank you, Jonathan from Bathurst Taxis. My 12:08:45  
46 question is who do you see taking these licences up? Do 12:08:47  
47 you see it being small networks and individuals or the 12:08:52

1 larger networks? 12:08:55  
2  
3 THE CHAIR: We don't have a view on that, but what we can 12:08:57  
4 point to is that recently there were a number of licences 12:09:01  
5 auctioned in the Sydney area and the prices that they were 12:09:05  
6 sold for, and I think the people who bought them, is on the 12:09:13  
7 public record. 12:09:17  
8  
9 MR TOOZE: That's correct, it is on the website. 12:09:20  
10  
11 THE CHAIR: It is on the Point to Point Commissioner's 12:09:21  
12 website. 12:09:23  
13  
14 MS TOWERS: And the price they paid. 12:09:25  
15  
16 THE CHAIR: And the price they paid. From memory, there 12:09:27  
17 is a mixture of small operators and one large operator. 12:09:29  
18  
19 MR SPENCE: I would like to posit that the likely people 12:09:35  
20 to pick up these plates are the large networks and I wonder 12:09:36  
21 what the impact on competition is going to be if the large 12:09:39  
22 networks do come in and cause the mayhem that has been 12:09:42  
23 described in this room today. 12:09:46  
24  
25 THE CHAIR: That is not the experience thus far in Sydney 12:09:49  
26 but we note your point. 12:09:51  
27  
28 MR SPENCE: This is not Sydney. 12:09:55  
29  
30 UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: This is not Sydney. 12:09:58  
31  
32 THE CHAIR: Who is next? Michael? 12:10:01  
33  
34 MR PHILLIPS: Just as a scenario, the rule is in or out. 12:10:06  
35 Okay. You have the licences across the state in the 12:10:12  
36 designated areas. If one large operator - I won't call 12:10:16  
37 them a network, I'll just call them an operator - wins a 12:10:24  
38 tender for X number of cabs and he moves into a particular 12:10:31  
39 area that he thinks is lucrative, he deposits X number of 12:10:35  
40 cabs there in competition with the local businesses, is 12:10:41  
41 there any means of preventing him from wiping out the 12:10:44  
42 competition and establishing his own network in that area? 12:10:48  
43  
44 MS VINCENT: I might respond to that question with a 12:11:03  
45 question, which is that people here have been telling us 12:11:08  
46 about their businesses and their customer base and the 12:11:13  
47 regular work that they're doing and I'm just wondering what 12:11:20

1 you think the competitive advantage would be for someone 12:11:27  
2 new coming in and trying to establish and why you would be 12:11:32  
3 the one going out of business rather than the new entrant? 12:11:37  
4  
5 You also earlier talked about the difficulty of 12:11:42  
6 getting into towns because it is not just about getting a 12:11:45  
7 licence, it's about advertising and all the rest of it, and 12:11:48  
8 I'm just wondering why you think the inevitable consequence 12:11:52  
9 of competition is that the incumbent would suffer rather 12:11:57  
10 than it being the new entrant not being able to get a 12:12:04  
11 foothold because you're already there. 12:12:08  
12  
13 MR MILLER: I can answer that. I come from an owner cab 12:12:13  
14 co-op. I have been in business for 20 years -- 12:12:15  
15  
16 THE CHAIR: I am sorry, just a second. 12:12:15  
17 12:12:20  
18 MR MILLER: I come from an owner cab co-op and we're taking 12:12:20  
19 steps to rectify that. I can assure you of what happened 12:12:24  
20 in New Zealand when they deregulated the industry there. 12:12:27  
21 I've been here for 20 years and had various positions 12:12:30  
22 within it. We spend half our life interfering and stopping 12:12:33  
23 fights. They got into it in the parks, they got into it 12:12:39  
24 out at the airport, people fighting over fares because 12:12:43  
25 we've oversupplied them: that's the reality of it. 12:12:47  
26  
27 Firstly, that's what we did. We spent most of our 12:12:49  
28 time at board meetings with, "Someone had a fight with me", 12:12:53  
29 "Someone took a fare off me", "Someone did this", and we 12:12:57  
30 spent time on it. There were fights on the ranks, there 12:13:01  
31 were fights in the park, and as directors we had to go and 12:13:02  
32 try and separate people and that's the consequence of 12:13:05  
33 having a free market that's oversupplied. Thank you. 12:13:08  
34  
35 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Michael. Anybody else, comments or 12:13:12  
36 questions? 12:13:17  
37  
38 MR PHILLIPS: Can I just answer the direct question that 12:13:20  
39 was put? If you're a large operator, now, I'm not going to 12:13:23  
40 put names here, but if you're a large taxi operator, now, 12:13:29  
41 this is in Victoria, large operations have established 12:13:33  
42 themselves with the new leasing arrangement, and you put 12:13:35  
43 into there, you've got the resources to back you to be able 12:13:42  
44 to advertise, you've got the resources to be able to buy 12:13:46  
45 vehicles, you've got the backing of an existing network 12:13:51  
46 that you can put into that town, you're well-resourced to 12:13:54  
47 make a very hard hit on an area that you might decide that 12:14:00

1 you want to take out and have for yourself. 12:14:05  
2  
3 This is not Guns N' Roses type stuff, it is just 12:14:11  
4 simply economics, that if you really do want an area, this 12:14:20  
5 presents an ideal opportunity for you to establish yourself 12:14:23  
6 quickly in an area. Once you beat off a few of the local 12:14:27  
7 people, you can then offer it to say to the rest of them, 12:14:31  
8 "I will give you X amount of dollars for your cab if you 12:14:35  
9 sell to me", and, effectively, you wipe out that existing 12:14:38  
10 operation to establish your own operation and if I was in 12:14:43  
11 business I wouldn't rule that out, if I was a major 12:14:47  
12 operator. 12:14:50  
13  
14 THE CHAIR: Thank you. 12:14:53  
15  
16 MS PHILLIPS: And they can do it cheaply. 12:14:54  
17  
18 MR ROGERS: I might just make a couple of comments and ask 12:15:05  
19 a couple of questions. Peter mentioned just earlier on, 12:15:07  
20 and it was discussed also in Coffs Harbour and maybe in 12:15:09  
21 Sydney as well, in terms of making a statement that taxi 12:15:13  
22 trips had not decreased, I don't know who made the 12:15:16  
23 presentation, that taxi rides had not decreased as a result 12:15:20  
24 of the increase of rideshare, or rideshare has been 12:15:23  
25 incremental. Just for the record, we would disagree with 12:15:28  
26 that and there is evidence to show from taxi companies and 12:15:31  
27 fares that the number of fares have decreased by up to 12:15:34  
28 30 per cent. 12:15:38  
29  
30 THE CHAIR: Martin, we're happy to have you submit that 12:15:39  
31 evidence to us, as we said before, and I think we asked the 12:15:44  
32 Taxi Council in September to provide any data that they 12:15:48  
33 could. 12:15:51  
34  
35 MR ROGERS: I think this goes to the question around 12:15:56  
36 information, the information that is being used, and Darryl 12:15:57  
37 asked the question about the information and research that 12:16:00  
38 has been done to provide the recommendations in the report, 12:16:02  
39 and at Coffs Harbour one of the things that came up was 12:16:05  
40 around a survey that was conducted to look at making these 12:16:08  
41 recommendations. 12:16:13  
42  
43 I will ask a question to the panel, that in the survey 12:16:15  
44 that came back it noted that if any of the sample sizes 12:16:19  
45 dropped below a minimum threshold and they appear as grey 12:16:24  
46 or semi-transparent form, these should be interpreted with 12:16:27  
47 caution and be as indicative only. 12:16:31

1  
2 I would ask the panel that if you look at all of the 12:16:35  
3 research from that report that has come back to do with 12:16:37  
4 regional New South Wales, how much of that is grey or 12:16:40  
5 semi-transparent on which you made decisions based on the 12:16:45  
6 outcomes of the livelihoods of these people? 12:16:48  
7  
8 THE CHAIR: What do we do when the government gives us a 12:16:53  
9 terms of reference to do something, we go and do it and we 12:16:56  
10 collect the best possible information there is and we made 12:17:00  
11 a considerable effort in this case to get additional 12:17:02  
12 information and to conduct surveys. As we've said before, 12:17:06  
13 if anybody has data and they want to pass it over and that 12:17:10  
14 will improve our data, we are happy to take it and that 12:17:14  
15 offer has been on the table for years. This is not the 12:17:18  
16 first time where we've had a review of taxi fares or taxi 12:17:22  
17 licences. 12:17:26  
18  
19 What we have done is we've made the best possible use 12:17:28  
20 of the data available. If you have additional data which 12:17:32  
21 you say is different from what we have, then we are more 12:17:37  
22 than happy to receive it. 12:17:40  
23  
24 MR ROGERS: The data says that all you've got is to be 12:17:43  
25 treated with caution and indicative only and you still make 12:17:45  
26 recommendations? 12:17:48  
27  
28 THE CHAIR: We have to make recommendations, Martin, 12:17:49  
29 that's our job. Our job is to make recommendations when 12:17:51  
30 the government asks us to and we make those recommendations 12:17:55  
31 based on the best possible data available and an extensive 12:18:01  
32 consultation process. For example, this is us collecting 12:18:04  
33 data, all your input is recorded and we go through that 12:18:07  
34 when we prepare our final recommendations. In a sense, you 12:18:11  
35 guys are giving us data now. The people in Coffs Harbour 12:18:15  
36 gave us data and the people in Sydney gave us data. 12:18:19  
37  
38 If the Taxi Council, or anybody else, wants to give us 12:18:21  
39 more data, we're happy to take it and then what we do is 12:18:25  
40 when we've got all that information, we then make 12:18:30  
41 recommendations and indeed a lot of that information which 12:18:33  
42 is collected by survey is scientifically and statistically 12:18:37  
43 based and it is not the first time that we've done it. 12:18:42  
44  
45 MR ROGERS: It's a new survey format, though. 12:18:46  
46  
47 MS TOWERS: We just used different companies. 12:18:49



1  
2 THE CHAIR: Different companies, similar approach. 12:18:50  
3  
4 MR ROGERS: I have concerns that you're going to make a 12:18:52  
5 recommendation and if the information that's provided does 12:18:54  
6 not meet the statistical perspective, do you make the 12:18:56  
7 recommendation based on assumptions or judgments? 12:19:01  
8  
9 THE CHAIR: We don't have the luxury of throwing our arms 12:19:04  
10 in the air and saying to the Minister, "We can't decide 12:19:06  
11 anything." We have to make a judgment and that's why you 12:19:09  
12 have a tribunal. There are three of us, including one 12:19:11  
13 other, where we have to exercise judgment. We exercise 12:19:14  
14 that judgment in the context of what you guys are telling 12:19:19  
15 us. 12:19:21  
16  
17 MR ROGERS: I feel that -- 12:19:23  
18 12:19:24  
19 MS TOWERS: There was a survey done, as you know, and also 12:19:24  
20 we've got the bank transaction data. 12:19:26  
21  
22 MR ROGERS: The bank transaction data operates, as we have 12:19:29  
23 spoken about before, on just the transactional data and 12:19:32  
24 EFTPOS transactions and it has been adjusted, but when you 12:19:35  
25 look at the other ways, we've got evidence that shows that 12:19:36  
26 there has been a decrease in fares of 30 per cent. You 12:19:42  
27 have that. That data has been presented to the Minister, 12:19:45  
28 showing that there has been a decrease of 30 per cent. 12:19:49  
29  
30 THE CHAIR: You haven't provided that to us, so we're 12:19:52  
31 happy to take that, Martin. 12:19:54  
32  
33 MR ROGERS: We just have the concern that the livelihoods 12:19:57  
34 of people here is being based on data that's not sufficient 12:19:59  
35 to make a valid judgment. There's a concern for us with 12:20:05  
36 this draft report. 12:20:09  
37  
38 THE CHAIR: You need not have that concern because the 12:20:11  
39 final recommendations we make are based on the data that 12:20:14  
40 we've used thus far, plus any additional data that you or 12:20:17  
41 anybody else provides to us, plus an extensive consultation 12:20:22  
42 process. It is based on the best available information. 12:20:25  
43 We don't have the luxury of throwing our arms in the air 12:20:30  
44 and saying to the government, "IPART can't do it." 12:20:35  
45  
46 MS TOWERS: And we have been requesting the data for some 12:20:39  
47 time. We did approach the Taxi Council back in September. 12:20:42

1  
2 THE CHAIR: We approached the Taxi Council back 12:20:45  
3 in September, possibly before your time. 12:20:45  
4  
5 MR CURRAN: You keep using the words "best available 12:20:48  
6 data". Two and three years ago, that data is not relevant 12:20:51  
7 so don't use it. It's quite simple, it is not the best 12:20:55  
8 available data. The best available data is what has 12:20:58  
9 happened in the taxi industry in the last 12 months. 12:21:01  
10  
11 THE CHAIR: Yes, and we have that information, Darryl. 12:21:03  
12  
13 MR CURRAN: You need to take the third and the second year 12:21:06  
14 out. 12:21:08  
15  
16 THE CHAIR: We have taken your point on that. We have had 12:21:08  
17 that information in the last 12 months and what has been 12:21:11  
18 particularly relevant as part of these sessions is, 12:21:14  
19 including from people like yourself and also in 12:21:17  
20 Coffs Harbour and Sydney, that people have advised us that 12:21:20  
21 things have changed very fast. 12:21:22  
22  
23 In the report we made it clear that with the changes 12:21:24  
24 recently introduced by the government, the point to point 12:21:28  
25 transport and things like that, that competition would move 12:21:32  
26 fast and we have that in the report. What these sessions 12:21:35  
27 have confirmed is that, indeed, it is moving fast and it's 12:21:38  
28 possibly moving faster than anybody, including IPART, 12:21:43  
29 anticipated. That's why these situations are valuable and 12:21:47  
30 we take that on board. 12:21:51  
31  
32 MR COLLIN: Greg Collin, Dubbo Radio Cabs. I am actually 12:21:57  
33 astounded that you can sit there and a couple of you have 12:22:04  
34 got very defensive at some of the data that Martin was 12:22:09  
35 putting out. I have always looked up to government 12:22:17  
36 departments that come up with recommendations. In the past 12:22:24  
37 I've trusted them where they've done their utmost to get 12:22:29  
38 the best information possible. 12:22:34  
39  
40 I think it is irresponsible to say that you can't just 12:22:36  
41 throw your hands in the air. You should be saying, "We 12:22:41  
42 don't have the best data that we can have, so we'll take a 12:22:46  
43 guess at what we do have and we will give you our 12:22:52  
44 recommendations." I am a little disappointed there. You 12:22:56  
45 did say that you asked the NSW Taxi Council. I don't know 12:23:02  
46 how that was asked. Was it an email, one letter? How far 12:23:05  
47 did you actually go to do your research? 12:23:12

1  
2 THE CHAIR: Greg, that's not quite a fair description of 12:23:18  
3 what we did, right? We are not taking a guess. We are 12:23:20  
4 making a judgment based on -- 12:23:25  
5  
6 MR COLLIN: On an assumption. 12:23:28  
7  
8 THE CHAIR: No, based on the information that is available 12:23:30  
9 and we will refine that judgment based on these sessions 12:23:33  
10 and you can rest assured that we've made considerable 12:23:38  
11 effort, and not just this year, in our previous reviews, to 12:23:42  
12 have the data supplied by the various bodies and it has not 12:23:46  
13 been forthcoming. 12:23:50  
14  
15 MS COPE: There seems to be an assumption that what's in 12:23:54  
16 the recommendation is actually a final recommendation and 12:23:57  
17 that this isn't part of the process. The draft report is 12:23:59  
18 very transparent in purposely putting down on paper exactly 12:24:04  
19 what we had to date in order to be able to have exactly 12:24:09  
20 this conversation about where the holes in it are and what 12:24:13  
21 you've got that will enable us to fill those holes. 12:24:18  
22  
23 If we didn't do that and we didn't make the 12:24:23  
24 recommendations that we thought fell from that then we 12:24:25  
25 wouldn't be having an honest and open conversation with you 12:24:29  
26 about where things are at the moment and allowing you to be 12:24:34  
27 able to provide this feedback. 12:24:37  
28  
29 This is not the end of the road, this is not the final 12:24:39  
30 recommendation, and it is not going to government based on 12:24:42  
31 simply what is in the draft report. This is part of the 12:24:44  
32 process to be able to speak now about what we've got so 12:24:47  
33 far, what extra we need, what we have missed and how it 12:24:52  
34 should change the recommendations. 12:24:56  
35  
36 MR COLLIN: Thank you for that. We do appreciate the time 12:24:58  
37 that you've given up to come out here and talk to us and 12:25:02  
38 take on board what we've got to say. We're hoping that our 12:25:07  
39 message is getting across. 12:25:11  
40  
41 My real concern is how do you think these plates are 12:25:17  
42 going to service the public? Really and truly, we've heard 12:25:23  
43 some emotional stuff here and like I said before, and 12:25:30  
44 I don't want to repeat myself, I've got drivers saying 12:25:34  
45 they're looking for work already if competition does come 12:25:36  
46 and what will happen is they will cherry-pick. If they 12:25:40  
47 pick up a licence for \$2,000 or \$10,000, they will be able 12:25:44

1 to afford just to sit back, not worry about the downtimes, 12:25:48  
2 but cherry-pick on Friday and Saturday nights and special 12:25:56  
3 events. That is where our biggest concern is. I won't be 12:26:00  
4 able to have my cab out there, so the public again will 12:26:04  
5 suffer because we won't be able to run a 24-hour 12:26:09  
6 7-day-a-week organisation. Thank you. 12:26:14  
7  
8 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Greg. 12:26:17  
9  
10 MS PHILLIPS: On the collection of data, how many networks 12:26:26  
11 have actually supplied statistics to the organisation? 12:26:30  
12 I can see your point and I said to Michael I don't know how 12:26:36  
13 you can do your job if we are not open and honest with the 12:26:40  
14 panel. We are not going to get the answers we're looking 12:26:47  
15 for if we don't provide the data. 12:26:50  
16  
17 I have provided some data but it's only my individual 12:26:55  
18 data and I don't see how we can argue a case if we're not 12:27:00  
19 going to provide the information. I can see your point of 12:27:04  
20 view. We're kicking ourselves in the head. 12:27:08  
21  
22 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Lyn. Jonathan? 12:27:13  
23  
24 MR SPENCE: Mr Boxall, can you answer that question? How 12:27:19  
25 many submissions have you had from networks with valuable 12:27:22  
26 statistics, firstly? 12:27:26  
27  
28 MS VINCENT: To date, none. 12:27:28  
29  
30 MS PHILLIPS: What are we doing here? Honestly. 12:27:29  
31  
32 MR BARLOW: You must have one: they just said none. 12:27:34  
33  
34 MS PHILLIPS: I have, but that's personal.  
35  
36 THE CHAIR: From networks. 12:27:40  
37  
38 MS VINCENT: We have had some individual submissions. 12:27:42  
39  
40 THE CHAIR: I am sorry, sir, for the record, could you 12:27:45  
41 identify yourself? 12:27:46  
42  
43 MR BARLOW: I am Greg from Dubbo Radio Cabs. I do have 12:27:50  
44 one question and it is to do with the licences. What is 12:27:54  
45 to stop a person coming in and buying 50 per cent of those 12:28:00  
46 licences, or tendering for 50 per cent and getting 12:28:05  
47 50 per cent? 12:28:10

1  
2 THE CHAIR: The draft recommendation is to have no 12:28:11  
3 restrictions on people purchasing the licences. 12:28:13  
4  
5 MR BARLOW: Isn't that a major issue? 12:28:17  
6  
7 THE CHAIR: That's why we're having a discussion about it. 12:28:20  
8 I've picked up from a number of people, including yourself, 12:28:23  
9 that that's a matter of concern. 12:28:26  
10  
11 MR BARLOW: Yes. Okay. The other thing that I've heard 12:28:29  
12 and I'm not being picky - I have spent most of my life in 12:28:33  
13 western New South Wales, like, the other side of the 12:28:36  
14 Darling, and I've been in Dubbo for 17 years, and I've 12:28:38  
15 heard you all say, "That's not our experience in Sydney." 12:28:44  
16 It stops at the range. There's no comparison to Sydney 12:28:48  
17 west of the range, and it's not just yourselves, I've heard 12:28:53  
18 it through more government departments than I care to think 12:28:58  
19 about. 12:29:02  
20  
21 THE CHAIR: I think the point that we were trying to make 12:29:02  
22 there, Greg, was that we were asked a question by Jonathan 12:29:04  
23 and others about, "Well, you know, somebody might come in 12:29:08  
24 and buy all the licences", right, one corporation might 12:29:09  
25 come in and buy the licences. What we can point to is 12:29:13  
26 because there has not been this sort of competitive tender 12:29:17  
27 outside Sydney before, that in Sydney, where they've had 12:29:19  
28 this competitive tender for about nine years, or something, 12:29:24  
29 that has not been the case. 12:29:27  
30  
31 MR BARLOW: The other thing is, well, straight off, I look 12:29:33  
32 at rideshare. We have not had a major issue with rideshare 12:29:36  
33 and that's due to price because there would be no 12:29:40  
34 difference in price because we've got an average fare of 12:29:43  
35 \$15 or \$14, so price is not the issue here, straight off. 12:29:46  
36 I've got a son who lives in Sydney. He uses rideshare in 12:29:53  
37 Sydney because they turn up. In Dubbo, when he comes home, 12:29:57  
38 he uses the cabs. 12:30:02  
39  
40 THE CHAIR: Thanks, Greg. Other questions or comments? 12:30:04  
41 Jonathan? 12:30:06  
42  
43 MR SPENCE: I seem to be monopolising this, don't I. 12:30:11  
44 I would just like to pick up on a point that was made 12:30:14  
45 earlier on and that is there are several networks here that 12:30:17  
46 I'm sure would welcome a member of the panel riding in our 12:30:19  
47 businesses for one or two days to find out what actually 12:30:23

1 happens, so I would like to really put that out there for 12:30:25  
2 the panel to consider, please. 12:30:28  
3  
4 Secondly, I would like to ask whether you're prepared 12:30:30  
5 to give an indication of whether the feedback you've 12:30:32  
6 received so far is likely to change your recommendation of 12:30:36  
7 137 plates and if so do you have a gut feeling about by how 12:30:41  
8 much? In other words, has this been of any real use to you 12:30:46  
9 or are you going to say, "We're recommending in the first 12:30:49  
10 place, in the draft recommendations." 12:30:53  
11  
12 THE CHAIR: This has been really useful and we will be 12:30:55  
13 modifying - I can't speak for the tribunal because we're 12:30:58  
14 yet to meet and there's a third member, but I am quite 12:31:02  
15 confident that we will be looking to review some of our 12:31:06  
16 recommendations. I can't say to what because that would be 12:31:10  
17 preempting the decision of the tribunal. We are 12:31:13  
18 independent, that's why the government asks us to do it, 12:31:17  
19 and so we'll do that, but as I said to Marino, who I think 12:31:19  
20 left early on, this is not a waste of time for you people. 12:31:24  
21  
22 MR SPENCE: Thank you very much. 12:31:29  
23  
24 MS COPE: What I can also say is that in previous 12:31:35  
25 inquiries there have been concrete changes to 12:31:37  
26 recommendations between the draft and the final as a result 12:31:39  
27 of feedback from people in regional areas. For example, in 12:31:43  
28 the buses we had a recommendation on fare structures. We 12:31:46  
29 were told by the operators in small regional areas that 12:31:51  
30 their technology didn't allow them to adopt, that it would 12:31:55  
31 be too costly. We changed that recommendation. 12:31:59  
32  
33 We had hearings around prices for water for irrigators 12:32:02  
34 in regional areas and they said, "We need a fundamental 12:32:08  
35 restructure of the price because it's damaging to our 12:32:11  
36 businesses." Those structures had been in for many years 12:32:14  
37 and we changed the structure of the prices in direct 12:32:18  
38 response to what they've said. There are some concrete 12:32:24  
39 examples of where we've changed our recommendations. 12:32:27  
40  
41 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Deborah. I was going to mention 12:32:30  
42 the water one too. We are really proud of that: it is in 12:32:32  
43 Bega, the Northern Rivers and the Peel Valley. Any other 12:32:36  
44 questions or comments? 12:32:41  
45  
46 MR J FAULKNER: John Faulkner from Dubbo Radio Cabs. 12:32:47  
47 Earlier you mentioned the value of the sale of taxi plates 12:32:50

1 in Dubbo as a factor in governing what was going on in the 12:32:54  
2 town and whether they needed more cabs and you considered 12:32:59  
3 that it was a factor that we must need more cars here. Do 12:33:02  
4 you ever give any credit to the people who operate this 12:33:07  
5 taxi service in Dubbo, Orange and Bathurst, the efficiency 12:33:10  
6 of the companies, the money we've spent over the years? 12:33:15  
7 We've put the call centre in Orange. We run our taxis like 12:33:18  
8 an army. I just can't see where you're coming from to work 12:33:22  
9 on the valuation of a taxi, to work out, say, you must need 12:33:26  
10 more taxis. 12:33:30  
11  
12 THE CHAIR: Thanks, John. I think the point that we were 12:33:33  
13 making and also the point about whether it is a designated 12:33:36  
14 zone or an exempt zone, that one of the factors we do look 12:33:41  
15 at is the recent transfer price for the licence and that's 12:33:45  
16 the transfer price for the licence aspect of it and we do 12:33:50  
17 look at that. 12:33:55  
18  
19 The reason is, as I explained before to somebody from 12:33:57  
20 up the back, that if you have a restricted number of 12:34:05  
21 licences for anything, including taxis, and people are 12:34:07  
22 prepared to pay a premium to get the right to operate it, 12:34:10  
23 then it is indicative, other things being equally, 12:34:15  
24 especially if it is a high amount, if it is a high amount 12:34:20  
25 it is indicative, other things being equal, that there 12:34:22  
26 might be an issue there. 12:34:26  
27  
28 MR FAULKNER: I am 80 years old this year and I'd love to 12:34:32  
29 sell out and I wouldn't even bother putting it on the 12:34:35  
30 market because I know I'd get nothing. I'd get a refusal, 12:34:39  
31 it's worth nothing. It's part of a superannuation package 12:34:44  
32 that I dreamed of. I've been in the taxi industry over 12:34:47  
33 20 years and everything that I value there is just wiped 12:34:50  
34 out by you blokes sitting up there. 12:34:53  
35  
36 THE CHAIR: We get that, that the price has fallen 12:34:56  
37 recently. We get it. 12:35:00  
38  
39 MR FAULKNER: "Crashed" is the better word. 12:35:04  
40  
41 THE CHAIR: "Crashed". Okay. 12:35:05  
42  
43 MS PERCEVAL: Wouldn't it be better, if somebody wanted to 12:35:17  
44 buy a plate, like one of those plates you've got on offer, 12:35:19  
45 and they wanted to work in a particular area, if they find 12:35:21  
46 out there are plates for sale in that area before they 12:35:26  
47 actually bought it? 12:35:29

1  
2 THE CHAIR: They might do that but that's up to them. If 12:35:31  
3 they want to investigate a certain area and see whether 12:35:35  
4 there are any plates they could buy, they might decide to 12:35:38  
5 do that rather than go along to the auction. 12:35:42  
6  
7 MS PERCEVAL: I thought that would be a better choice than 12:35:44  
8 having other plates up for sale. 12:35:47  
9  
10 THE CHAIR: You mean rather than having plates up for 12:35:48  
11 sale?  
12  
13 MS PERCEVAL: Yes, the ones that you said, the 137, if 12:35:51  
14 someone wants to buy plates then check that area out first. 12:35:54  
15  
16 THE CHAIR: Yes, and there is the issue also of licences 12:35:58  
17 on hold, which is a similar point. 12:36:00  
18  
19 MS L DAVIDSON: My comment was exactly the same. 12:36:07  
20 Lorna Davidson. I wanted to back John up. I've been in 12:36:12  
21 the cabs exactly the same time as he has and at that time, 12:36:22  
22 20 years ago, I paid \$300,000 for one cab. 20 years later, 12:36:28  
23 I think I would probably get a little over half that, if 12:36:36  
24 that, now. That must tell us that something has gone 12:36:40  
25 radically wrong somewhere. 12:36:45  
26  
27 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Lorna. 12:36:49  
28  
29 MR K BYRNES: Ken Byrnes from Mudgee Radio Cabs. We're 12:36:54  
30 going down the line of some years ago, not that far back, 12:36:57  
31 where a certain bus company over in my area in Mudgee 12:37:03  
32 decided to do hail-a-ride, dial-a-ride. I got on board 12:37:06  
33 with that. "This is a taxi service. What are you trying 12:37:14  
34 to do?" He argued and we fought and we fought and we went 12:37:18  
35 through and we went right to the government and we stopped 12:37:21  
36 him from doing dial-a-ride, but now I can see with 12:37:23  
37 releasing of these plates that we'll get one or two plates 12:37:28  
38 start up and then run in hard competition against what we 12:37:32  
39 do and wipe us right out. 12:37:36  
40  
41 He had the offer of buying the plates at a reasonable 12:37:40  
42 price some years ago and he didn't want to do it. I can 12:37:42  
43 see this is where this is going to go. Down the line I've 12:37:45  
44 got seven freehold plates that won't be worth a crumpet and 12:37:48  
45 I won't make decent money out of them because this operator 12:37:53  
46 will go hard against me and put me down, put me under. He 12:37:56  
47 won't worry about the people after two o'clock in the 12:38:00



1 morning or four or five o'clock in the morning, where I go 12:38:03  
2 24/7. He will just close it, I'll have to close, and 12:38:07  
3 that's where this is going to end up. We'll all be broke, 12:38:10  
4 thanks to IPART and the government. Thank you. 12:38:13  
5  
6 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Ken. Any other comments or 12:38:16  
7 questions? Jonathan? 12:38:19  
8  
9 MR SPENCE: I would like to follow up and get an answer to 12:38:26  
10 my earlier question about is someone on the panel willing 12:38:29  
11 to come and do a ride-on in one of my networks? 12:38:34  
12  
13 THE CHAIR: We will take that on notice, Jonathan. Thank 12:38:37  
14 you. Any other questions or comments? Can I wrap up? 12:38:39  
15 Yes? All right. Thank you very much for coming and thanks 12:38:59  
16 very much for a very useful discussion and I appreciate the 12:39:00  
17 effort that you've put in in taking time out from your jobs 12:39:04  
18 to come here. 12:39:08  
19  
20 We have had a lot of useful input. We have had input 12:39:11  
21 which has reinforced the input that we received in 12:39:15  
22 Coffs Harbour and Sydney and this will help the tribunal in 12:39:19  
23 making its decision. 12:39:23  
24  
25 I will just reiterate that submissions to our draft 12:39:26  
26 report are due by 9 February and I encourage you to make a 12:39:28  
27 submission, including any information you have to support 12:39:33  
28 your position, any data. That would be much appreciated. 12:39:35  
29  
30 The transcript of this hearing will be available on 12:39:40  
31 our website in a few days time. We will consider all the 12:39:42  
32 feedback we receive and submit our final report with the 12:39:46  
33 final recommendations to the Minister by 9 March. Thank 12:39:50  
34 you very much and have a good afternoon. Martin? 12:39:55  
35  
36 MR ROGERS: I was just going to say, obviously, thank you 12:40:01  
37 to Peter and the members of IPART for taking the time to 12:40:04  
38 come out to Dubbo today and especially also to Kelly and 12:40:06  
39 David for their time. 12:40:09  
40  
41 The 9th, which is Friday, which is this week, is 12:40:12  
42 what's required for the submissions. While we've given our 12:40:14  
43 feedback here today, I think it is really important that 12:40:17  
44 each of us do document our concerns and you may add to 12:40:19  
45 those from what you've heard today. We may also be 12:40:22  
46 reaching out to you to help provide some data to provide a 12:40:25  
47 final recommendation that is appropriate to our industry, 12:40:32

1 so you may see some correspondence from us. 12:40:34  
2  
3 As at this date, IPART has mentioned that they have no 12:40:40  
4 data from the taxi industry to make their recommendations, 12:40:42  
5 so if we're able to assist in that then we may look at that 12:40:45  
6 and help them. Note that Friday the 9th is our deadline to 12:40:50  
7 get those submissions in. Thank you again for taking the 12:40:54  
8 time to travel far and wide to come here today. We just 12:40:56  
9 have to note that that date is the date we have to meet. 12:40:59  
10 Thanks very much. 12:41:02  
11  
12 THE CHAIR: Thank you, Martin. Have a good afternoon. 12:41:03  
13 There is lunch if you want a bite of lunch on the way. 12:41:08  
14  
15 THE TRIBUNAL ADJOURNED AT 12.41PM 12:41:29  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47